

1 Joseph J. Tabacco, Jr. (75484)
jtabacco@bermandevalerio.com
2 Christopher T. Heffelfinger (118058)
cheffelfinger@bermandevalerio.com
3 **BERMAN DEVALERIO**
425 California Street, Suite 2100
4 San Francisco, CA 94104
Telephone: (415) 433-3200
5 Facsimile: (415) 433-6382

6 Mindee J. Reuben
reuben@wka-law.com
7 **WEINSTEIN KITCHENOFF & ASHER LLC**
1845 Walnut Street, Suite 1100
8 Philadelphia, PA 19103
Telephone: (215) 545-7200
9 Facsimile: (215) 535-6535

10 Attorneys for Plaintiffs in
Bruno, et al. v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.,
11 No. C-09-00445 JCS

12
13 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
14 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

15 ANDREA RESNICK, GARY BUNKER,)
16 JOHN HALEY, AMY LATHAM, ERIC)
17 ROSLANSKY and KEVIN SIMSPON, on)
behalf of themselves and others similarly)
situated,)
18)
19 *Plaintiffs,*)
vs.)
20 WALMART.COM USA LLC, WAL-MART)
STORES, INC. and NETFLIX, INC.)
21)
22 *Defendants.*)

Case No. C-09-0002 PJH

**ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO
CONSIDER WHETHER CASES
SHOULD BE RELATED**

1 **TO ALL PARTIES AND THEIR COUNSEL OF RECORD:**

2 PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiffs Brandon J. Bruno and Paige Gabay submit this
3 Administrative Motion, pursuant to Civil Local Rule 3-12, to relate *Bruno, et al. v. Walmart.com*
4 *USA LLC, et al.*, Case No. C-09-00445-JCS (“the *Bruno* Action”), filed January 30, 2009, to
5 *Resnick, et al. v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.*, Case No. C-09-0002 PJH (“*Resnick* Action”), the
6 first filed action.

7 **I. RELATED CASES**

8 The cases identified below, including the first-filed *Resnick* Action, are related to the *Bruno*
9 Action. As indicated, most of these cases are now pending before The Honorable Phyllis J.
10 Hamilton, United States District Judge.

| | CASE NAME | CASE NUMBER | DATE FILED |
|----|--|-----------------|------------------|
| 11 | | | |
| 12 | 1. <i>Resnick, et al. v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0002-PJH | January 2, 2009 |
| 13 | | | |
| 14 | 2. <i>O'Connor v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0096- PJH | January 9, 2009 |
| 15 | 3. <i>Endzweig v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0111-PJH | January 9, 2009 |
| 16 | 4. <i>Schmitz v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0116-PJH | January 9, 2009 |
| 17 | 5. <i>Lynch v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0138-PJH | January 12, 2009 |
| 18 | 6. <i>Groce v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0139-PHJ | January 12, 2009 |
| 19 | 7. <i>Sivek v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0156- PJH | January 13, 2009 |
| 20 | 8. <i>Faris v. Walmart Stores, Inc.</i> | CV-09-0180- PJH | January 14, 2009 |
| 21 | 9. <i>Slobodin v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0225- PJH | January 16, 2009 |
| 22 | 10. <i>Anthony v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0236- PJH | January 20, 2009 |
| 23 | 11. <i>Polk-Stamps v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0244- PJH | January 20, 2009 |
| 24 | 12. <i>Sheeler v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0274- PJH | January 22, 2009 |
| 25 | 13. <i>Chapman v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0294- PJH | January 22, 2009 |
| 26 | 14. <i>Orozco v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0297- PJH | January 22, 2009 |
| 27 | 15. <i>Landels v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0340- PJH | January 26, 2009 |
| 28 | 16. <i>Grime v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0349- PJH | January 26, 2009 |

| | CASE NAME | CASE NUMBER | DATE FILED |
|-----|--|-----------------|------------------|
| 17. | <i>Meyer v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0361- PJH | January 27, 2009 |
| 18. | <i>Randall v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0368- PJH | January 27, 2009 |
| 19. | <i>Hirsch v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0375- PJH | January 27, 2009 |
| 20. | <i>Miscioscia v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0377- PJH | January 27, 2009 |
| 21. | <i>Patras v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0378-MEJ | January 27, 2009 |
| 22. | <i>Chatelain v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0391- PJH | January 28, 2009 |
| 23. | <i>Weiner v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0398-BZ | January 28, 2009 |
| 24. | <i>Millrood v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0399-JCS | January 28, 2009 |
| 25. | <i>Kober v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0400-EDL | January 28, 2009 |
| 26. | <i>Lacabe v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.</i> | CV-09-0402-JL | January 28, 2009 |
| 27. | <i>Roy v. Netflx, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0434-JL | January 30, 2009 |
| 28. | <i>Zaker v. Netflix, Inc., et al.</i> | CV-09-0447-MEJ | January 30, 2009 |

II. RELATIONSHIP OF THE ACTIONS

This administrative motion is made on the grounds that the *Bruno* case involves substantially the same subject matter as the actions listed above in Section I, including the *Resnick* Action: an alleged conspiracy to illegally fix, raise, maintain and/or stabilize the prices charged for the sales and online rentals of DVDs in the United States. Plaintiffs in all the cases assert claims for violations of the Sherman Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1 and 2, against the same Defendants.

It appears likely that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or the possibility of conflicting results if the cases are conducted before different Judges. Accordingly, relating the *Bruno* Action to the *Resnick* Action will help eliminate duplicative discovery, prevent inconsistent pretrial rulings, and conserve the resources of the parties, their counsel, and the judiciary.

///

///

///

1 **III. CONCLUSION**

2 Plaintiffs Bruno and Gabay therefore respectfully request that the *Bruno* Action be deemed
3 related *Resnick, et al. v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.*, No. C-09-0002-PJH, and that it be assigned
4 to the Honorable Phyllis J. Hamilton.

5 Dated: February 5, 2009

BERMAN DeVALERIO

6
7 By: s/ Christopher T. Heffelfinger
CHRISTOPHER T. HEFFELFINGER

8 Joseph J. Tabacco, Jr
9 425 California Street, Suite 2100
San Francisco, CA 94104
10 Telephone: 415.433.3200
Facsimile: 415.433.6382

11 Mindee J. Reuben
12 reuben@wka-law.com
WEINSTEIN KITCHENOFF & ASHER LLC
13 1845 Walnut Street, Suite 1100
Philadelphia, PA 19103
14 Telephone: (215) 545-7200
Facsimile: (215) 535-6535

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs in*
16 *Bruno, et al. v. Walmart.com USA LLC, et al.,*
17 *No. C-09-00445 JCS*